

Turkey's Reasons to Normalize Diplomatic Relations with Israel in 2021

Isyfa Zahrotul Mufidah

Muhammadiyah Malang University

Email: isyfazahrotulmufidah11@webmail.umm.ac.id

Haryo Prasodjo

Muhammadiyah Malang University

Email: haryoprasodjo@umm.ac.id

Najamuddin Khairur Rijal

Muhammadiyah Malang University

Email: najamuddin@umm.ac.id

Havidz Ageng Prakoso

Muhammadiyah Malang University

Email: havidz@umm.ac.id

Abstract

This article discusses the reasons for Turkey's normalization with Israel in 2021. Diplomatic relations between the two sides have been established for more than 70 years since the state of Israel was founded, although the dynamics of their relationship have experienced ups and downs. This study is qualitative research in which the analysis of this phenomenon is taken from news reference sources, articles, reports and documents, using the theory of Foreign Policy Analysis by Valerie M.Hudson. The results of this analysis show that three important aspects make Turkey carry out normalization with Israel, first from an economic perspective which is the main aspect of normalization, second from a political aspect and finally from a security or military perspective. Israel has become Turkey's strategic partner even though as an Islamic country that carries out normalization with the Jewish state, this is a strategy that Turkey wants to build, because this policy it is the foundation for achieving national interests.

Keywords: *Foreign Policy, Normalization, Ambivalence, Bilateral Relations*

Abstrak

Artikel ini membahas mengenai alasan Turki melakukan normalisasi dengan Israel di tahun 2021. Hubungan diplomatik diantara kedua belah pihak telah terjalin lebih dari 70 tahun lamanya semenjak negara Israel berdiri, meskipun dinamika hubungannya mengalami naik turun. Studi ini adalah penelitian kualitatif dimana analisis fenomena ini diambil dari sumber referensi berita, artikel, laporan dan dokumen, dengan menggunakan teori Foreign Policy Analysis oleh Valerie M.Hudson. Hasil analisis ini menunjukkan bahwa terdapat tiga aspek penting yang membuat Turki melakukan normalisasi dengan Israel, pertama dari segi ekonomi yang menjadi aspek utama dalam normalisasi, kedua dari aspek politik dan terakhir dari segi kemanan atau miiter. Israel menjadi mitra strategis Turki meskipun sebagai negara islam yang melakukan normalisasi dengan negara Yahudi, hal ini merupakan strategi yang ingin dibangun Turki, karena dengan kebijakan tersebut adalah landasan untuk meraih kepentingan nasional.

Keywords: *Kebijakan Luar Negeri, Normalisasi, Ambivalensi, Hubungan Bilateral*

INTRODUCTION

Turkey is a country located on the continents of Asia and Europe, which has the largest Muslim majority, and adheres to a secular democratic republic system. This made Turkey have the goal of obtaining and maintaining ties with Western countries, besides that this decision was a step toward the modern Turkish Republic. Turkey and Israel have established cooperative relations since the establishment of the state of Israel

in 1950 and became the first Islamic country to cooperate with a Jewish state (representation of a western country) in the Middle East. Nevertheless, the relationship between the two countries has experienced ups and downs due to several factors that can affect a cooperative relationship between countries. Turkey recognizes that Israel is a strategic partner in several fields such as economy, politics and security (Dunia Tempo, 2016).

Turkey's foreign policy orientation regarding "Zero Problems With Neighbors" is one of Turkey's foreign policies to maintain good relations among its neighbors, live in peace and establish profitable cooperation, as well as become a regional power in the Middle East, this policy certainly has its reasons for being adopted, none other than realizing its national interests (Askerov, 2017). One of them is that Turkey has a commitment to Palestinian freedom regarding the seizure of territory by Israel, and various humanitarian assistance was carried out by Turkey, Turkey's attitude has made its relationship with Israel experience ups and downs (Ananggadipa, 2021). In fact, in 2009 Israel attacked the Gaza area which strained relations between the two sides (Rafqy, 2017). After the attack on the Gaza region, Turkey provided assistance through the Mavi Marmara Ship, but on the way to Palestine there was an incident of attack by Israel which claimed the lives of the Turks, this incident became a strong reason for the termination of Turkish and Israeli cooperation (Syahrul, 2017). In the Mavi Marmara conflict, Turkey put forward several conditions to be able to normalize its relations with Israel,

one of which is to open the blockade of the Gaza strip (Nurhalizah, 2019).

Turkey's foreign policy regarding Palestine has always been a factor that exacerbated Turkish and Israeli relations, because Palestine has a prolonged conflict regarding the struggle for territory with Israel as Turkey's cooperation partner. The normalization policy with Israel that is carried out by Turkey along with this commitment to Palestine itself seems ambivalent, the realization of normalization with Israel is a strategy that is being carried out by Turkey. The interdependence between Israel and Turkey means that the two countries will continue to have diplomatic relations despite experiencing obstacles in cooperation. Various cooperation regarding the economy has been carried out by both parties, even from a security perspective Turkey supplies all weapons from Israel, as well as Israel taking advantage of this cooperation to become a strategic partner in the dynamics of the Middle East regarding its security aspects. Two years after carrying out normalization again in 2016, relations between them experienced a decline due to the move of the Israeli embassy in Jerusalem in 2018 (Dunia Tempo, 2019). Up to 4 years of the termination of relations, from

2021 to 2022 will show progress between the two countries regarding plans to return to normalization of relations between Turkey and Israel (Dunia Tempo 2022). Moreover, the inflation that is currently occurring in Turkey in 2021, which is increasing, is a strong reason for Turkey to normalize diplomatic relations with Israel again (CNBC News, 2022).

According to previous research by A Rizki Tahmi, Mohamad Rosyidin, and Muhammad Faizal Alfian in a journal entitled "Analisis Kepentingan Nasional Uni Emirate Arab dalam Normalisasi Hubungan dengan Israel" (Tahmi et al., 2022), said that the United Arab Emirates carried out the first normalization with Israel to achieve the need towards a better UAE economy which is the main level in normalizing, not only that but on the political, security and also peace aspects. The research entitled "Normalisasi Hubungan Timur Tengah-Israel dalam Perspektif Tori Neorealisme" by Daffa Nughroho Ananda (Ananda, 2020), says that the agreement of Arab countries which includes the UAE country which is shaded by America through the "Abraham Accord" has received debate, including this shows indifference to Palestinian

independence, because the one who benefits the most here is Israel compared to other Arab countries that carry out normalization with Israel. The normalization of Arab countries is a new rationality for the continuation of the interests of each country, broadly speaking on security and economic aspects, based on research in the journal Mandala by Yullia Rimapradesi and Amad Sahide entitled "Kepentingan Negara-Negara Arab (Uni Emirat Arab, Bahrain, Sudan dan Maroko) Melakukan Normalisasi Hubungan dengan Israel" (Rimapraesi & Sahide, 2021). In contrast to Turkey, even though it is the first Arab country to recognize the state of Israel and carry out normalization, despite its national interests, Turkey still adheres to the struggle for independence and realizes a Palestinian-Israeli two-state solution, but interestingly, the two countries still accept each other, this is evidenced by a history of disconnection several times, quoted from the journal American of the Center for the Study of Law & Public Policy entitled "Turkey-Israel Relations" by Jay Alan Sekulow (Sekulow, 2016).

This research is interesting to examine more deeply because the nature of Turkey's ambivalent

policy with Israel shows conflict. To better understand and analyze Turkey's reasons for normalizing with Israel, the author uses the Foreign Policy Analysis Theory by Valerie M. Hudson. This theory is used to explain Turkey's reasons for normalizing with Israel which focuses on the level of analysis of national attributes and international systems, these two aspects that encourage Turkey to carry out normalization. Because foreign policy is a means to achieve the national interests of a country, the actions taken by Turkey are the result of a foreign policy process based on considerations, opportunities and consequences that will occur if normalization with Israel is realized. So the purpose of this paper is to see Turkey's reasons for normalizing relations with Israel in 2021.

THEORITICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH METHOD

Foreign Policy Analysis Theory

This study uses the Foreign Policy Analysis theory belonging to Valerie M. Hudson (Valerie, 2007) in analyzing the phenomenon of Turkey's reasons for normalizing with Israel. In analyzing foreign policy, a level of analysis is needed, according to Valerie M. Hudson, dividing it into two, namely the

micro level of analysis (individuals; groups; culture and national identity; domestic politics and opposition) and also the macro level, namely national attributes and the international system. At the macro level this will show how certain values and variables lead to the types of foreign policy choices, but here the author focuses on the level of analysis of national attributes and the international system. National attributes and the international system become of the important aspects in analyzing the Turkish normalization phenomenon, the level of analysis chosen by the author is considered the most relevant in explaining this phenomenon, because each level of analysis has its foundation in explaining a phenomenon. Thus the author takes the macro level of analysis, namely the national attributes and the international system in responding to the Turkey-Israel phenomenon, as well as the national attributes, the author takes 3 aspects that are suitable and relevant to this phenomenon. Because this is a foreign policy analysis and not all variables are included in the study, it is very necessary to rank the analysis and choose which part of Valerie M. Hudson's theory is relevant to the research phenomenon.

National attributes are the national strengths of a country, and they are used in carrying out a policy process because the state is the main actor. National attributes have 7 variables including size, natural resources, geography, demography, political system, military strength and economic capability. This measure has the meaning of the condition of a country that has a small size or a country that has a large size which will later affect the cooperation itself, because usually large countries are more attractive in determining their foreign policy with other countries, especially to smaller countries because they are brave in making decisions. take risks in world politics, but this must also be accompanied by other conditions such as state territory. Natural Resources owned by the state include oil, minerals; uranium, a mine that is also a determining factor in foreign policy. Geographic includes territorial boundaries, and access to airport or port facilities, absolutely which concerns the geographical conditions of a country. Demographics include gender, religion, race, distribution of welfare, education and health and the number of people in the country. The Political system is a system that exists in a country, divided into

non-democratic and democratic. The military capability of a country also influences which direction of its foreign policy, which consists of the level of armed forces, technology, and military strength will be useful in exerting influence or control or pressure on other countries. Economic capacity, economic dependence and also trade will greatly influence foreign policy, because this will create cooperation among countries, especially in a competitive economic era. The economic capabilities of each country are different, the wealth of one country will inevitably affect the behavior of other countries.

Thus, the author takes the factors of natural resources, military and economic capabilities in analyzing the phenomena that the writer examines, because these factors encourage the normalization of relations between Turkey and Israel. So that this level of analysis is very in line with Turkey's policy of normalizing its relationship with Israel because it sees the opportunities that Israel provides to Turkey and vice versa, in achieving its national interests, namely in security, economic and political aspects. Then the international system and national attributes will be interconnected, An anarchic

world makes a country have to balance its country with a coalition. So the rule of balance is to increase the ability to negotiate rather than fight. The international system is an activity between countries in carrying out their foreign policies, and this international system applies by looking at several variables such as the military or the economy, because this is related to power in the international world. Hudson believes that this position is a place for activities in responding to issues that exist in the international scope. So that it will be in accordance with Turkey's strategy to become a power in the Middle East region and achieve its national interests, especially in responding to the phenomenon of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict as well as becoming a strategic partner for Middle Eastern countries in accordance with its foreign policy of "Zero Problem With Neighbor".

This analysis uses a qualitative method, the qualitative method examines and understands a phenomenon. Qualitative research itself explains the truth not only by focusing on the facts, but also focusing on the meaning contained behind these facts. The focus of this research is on the national interest of Turkey which is to be achieved through its foreign policy related to

normalization with Israel, related to this the source of data used by the author is secondary data that has been widely distributed on the internet, in the form of journals, books and news. Data collection techniques with documentation techniques, by collecting documents and information related to the discussion will then be studied more deeply and become a further analysis or interpretation in this paper. (Nasution, 2003)

RESULT AND EXPLANATION

Turkey's Reasons for Normalizing Diplomatic Relations with Israel

Turkey and Israel diplomatic relations were held for the first time in Tel Aviv since 1950, since Israel officially became a country. Bilateral relations between the two countries had phases, none other than the first level in 1948-1992 called the initial period, and the second level in 1992-2008 which was dubbed the golden period with a history of good relations between the two. The third level occurred in 2010 where this period was the era of the fracture between Turkey and Israel. National security makes cooperation between the two parties realize the continuity of diplomatic relations. Israel as one of the Jewish countries that stood in the Middle East region squeezed

by several Muslim countries felt several threats from the region. It was this threat that made Israel and Turkey's relationship grow, so that in this initial phase the cooperation between the two was intertwined because they have an interest in the security and defense sector.

The tragedy of the Suez Canal in 1967 made war between Arab countries and Israel, in this incident Turkey was able to show sympathy for Arab countries without destroying relations with Israel (Harhara, 2018). To maintain neutrality with Israel as well as with several Arab countries in the Suez incident, Turkey agreed to UN Resolution 242 regarding the return of Israeli-occupied territories. In 1975 Turkey officially had the determination to liberate Palestine by officially recognizing the Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) even as one of its foreign policy objectives. In 1980 there was the annexation of East Jerusalem by Israel, so Turkey reduced its activities and also its diplomatic representation with Israel, none other than to protect the investment from Arab countries and protect the Turkish economy. Even though the relationship between the two was tenuous, cooperation was still carried out, especially in the tourism aspect which later gave

rise to cooperation in other fields (Smith, 2000). In 1986 Turkey increased its cooperation by sending representatives of the Permanent Representative and demonstrating non-military progress and military defense.

Occupying 1992 relations between Turkey and Israel progressed, from 1992 to 2008 this was referred to as the golden phase. Turkey and Israel agreed to *Security and Secrecy Agreement* (SSA) cooperation in 1994, this collaboration was also part of America after the cold war in the Middle East (Michel, 2014). Not only that, in 1996 the *Military Training Cooperation Agreement* (MTCA) was signed. The first exercise called *Operation Reliant Mermaid* was carried out, to simulate joint rescue at sea, the exercise also involved America and Jordan as observers. In 2001 Israel established security cooperation with NATO until 2004 it turned into the *Istanbul Cooperation Initiative* (ICI) partnership to neutralize Israel's rivals in the Middle East region. The agreement was also followed by various countries such as Egypt, Israel, Jordan, Mauritania, Algeria, Morocco and Tunisia, and has succeeded in neutralizing Israel's enemies in Arab countries. Not only

cooperation in the security sector, but 2004 Turkey also cooperated in the economic field regarding the availability of clean water significantly within 20 years, by providing 50 million cubic meters of drinking water from Turkey to Israel (Judi, 2015)

In 2008 it carried out cooperation in the energy aspect of oil and natural gas which also involves the countries of Georgia and Azerbaijan as suppliers, a gas pipeline will be built under the sea Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan (BTC) known as the *South Caucasus Gas Pipeline* (SCGPL) has a route from the Shakh Deniz gas field Azerbaijan goes through Georgia and on to Turkey, where it transplants additionally to Greece and Italy. The cooperation is growing with the construction of additional pipelines under the Mediterranean Sea, the prospect is funded by the European Industrial Bank (Guzel, 2017). This will later benefit East Asian consumers such as China, India, South Korea to save time in shipping oil (Kompas News, 2016). However, this collaboration was canceled due to the heating up of relations after the *Gaza Flotilla Raid* (Arabel, 2014). This period is referred to as a period of a rift between the two parties, Turkey's abnormalization of

Israel occurred because of tensions between the two parties who had their interests and caused a breakdown in cooperation with the cancellation of agreements regarding non-intervention (Barston, 2014), Israel has killed 1417 victims souls on the Palestinian side in the attack on Gaza or what is called the *Gaza Massacre*. Turkey strongly condemns the *Gaza Massacre* and Israel has promised to resolve the Palestinian conflict peacefully and there will be no military attacks (Dyah, 2018).

In 2010 Turkey sent aid to Palestine after the Gaza Massacre incident via the Mavi Marmara ship and tried to penetrate the Israeli blockade, but was attacked by Israel which killed 9 people and injured several Turkish citizens who were on board the Mavi Marmara. Because the incident triggered various sensitive Turkish responses in several forums and policies, the *Gaza Flotilla Raid* is considered by Turkey a terrorist attack. This cannot be underestimated by Turkey, the worst historical incident that ever happened during its cooperation with Israel, various conditions were put forward by Turkey regarding demands for the Mavi Marmara attack, on the other hand Israel was tough and did not show any decision to apologize to

Turkey (Turkish Minute, 2016). The normalization negotiations took place both informally and formally. Until finally it led to the *Palmer Report* which was sheltered by the United Nations and also America (Era Muslim News, 2022), but ended in dissimilar goals, as well as the termination of normalization between the two parties. *The Plamer Reports* that were planned to progress the relationship increasingly made the cooperation decline between the two of them. The apology was considered by Israel an embarrassment to its country in the eyes of the international world, while Turkey is still waiting for Israel's responsibility for the incident. Even though it ended in peace in 2016, tensions occurred again in 2018 due to the transfer of the Israeli embassy to Jerusalem (Kompas News, 2022), various demonstrations that cost lives have taken place over this act of rebellion. Turkey, which commits to peace between the two Israeli-Palestinian countries, condemned this action which led to the termination of relations and the withdrawal of ambassadors from America and Israel. After 4 years of relations between the two parties, Israel and Turkey have begun to show their closeness again, and various plans and normalization

efforts have been made from 2021 to 2022 to return to cooperation as before (Republika News, 2022). Turkey and Israel are two countries that need each other, even though they have different interests that have strained their relationship. Behind the phenomenon of this relationship, the two countries have their reasons for all policies or decisions that they carry out. As explained above, Turkey cannot be separated from Israel to achieve one of its national interests and relations between the two countries will continue because of the interdependence factor itself, using the Foreign Policy Analysis theory from Valerie M.Hudson at the level of analysis of national attributes and the international system, then will answer Turkey's reasons for normalizing with Israel, where national attributes and the international system are one of the factors that drive this relationship. Israel is Turkey's strategic partner in achieving its national interests in several fields, namely politics, economy and military or security.

Political Factors Encouraging Normalization of Turkey-Israel

After breaking ties in 2018, Israel's first visit to Turkey yielded results, dialogues were underway to restart cooperation after several years of a rift. Turkey hopes that the

Palestinian issue can be resolved, the need for a two-state solution and urges it to avoid endangering the Israeli-Palestinian peace process (Republika News, 2022). Turkey is concerned about the many Palestinian victims who died and were injured in the West Bank and Al-Aqsa Mosque during the month of Ramadan 2022. Turkey has also proposed to reopen access to Al-Aqsa Mosque and other sites in Israel for Palestinians. In addition, Turkey wants Israel to guard the Al-Aqsa Mosque and open it for worship and close it to non-Muslim visits (Anadolu Agency, 2022). This is Turkey's hope for Israel if diplomatic relations are re-established, which was conveyed at several normalization efforts meetings.

It is hoped that the establishment of relations between Turkey and Israel will act as a bridge for a peaceful solution for the two states of Israel and Palestine. Not only that for security stability in the Middle East. Turkey has 3 methodologies and 5 operational principles that drive its foreign policy (IEMed, 2012). The first methodological principle is a "visionary" approach to issues, for example; Turkey has a Middle East vision that is fair and impartial to only one of the issues in

the Middle East Region, such as only not only focusing on issues against the PKK (Kurdistan Workers' Party), Syria Issues and also several other issues. Thus Turkey has its diplomatic assets and a unique understanding of the Middle East, so several agendas can be carried out effectively. As in Turkey's Lebanese Policy, involvement in the Iranian nuclear issue, even regarding Israel and achieving Palestinian reconciliation. The second principle is "consistent and systematic" throughout the world, Turkey's Vision for the Middle East does not conflict with its approach in Central Asia, Africa and even Asia, Turkey seeks to improve relations with nearby countries such as Iraq, Greece, Russia and Syria. The third methodological principle is the adoption of a new discourse and diplomatic style" in which Turkey applies the principle of not making threats despite having a sufficiently convincing military defense, and also Turkey prioritizes civilian economic power as a new language in regional and international politics.

From the methodological approach above, Turkey also has 5 operational principles to guide foreign policymaking. The first principle of "balance between security and democracy" Turkey

wants to provide freedom and security to its citizens by not taking human rights, this is a big step in protecting civil liberties. The second principle is "*Zero Problems With Neighbors*" cultivating and maintaining good relations with neighbors in the Middle East region as well as becoming a regional power in the Middle East for its dedication to peace, which is Turkey's main goal. Turkey wants to build a more cooperative channel with its neighbors in which to discuss economic, political and security issues. The third principle is "proactive and pre-imperative peace diplomacy" intending to take action before a more severe crisis, this policy is based on international security, with high-level political dialogue, interdependence and consistency, one of which is Turkey's role between Israel and Palestine, Serbian and Bosnian reconciliation as well as several other conflicts in the Middle East. The fourth principle is Turkey's "multi-dimensional foreign policy" to minimize adversaries and is more willing to build complementary cooperation. The fifth principle is "rhythmic diplomacy" which is Turkey's aim to take an active role in international relations, international

organizations and all issues of global and international importance.

Turkey's foreign policy itself aims to play an influential role in regional conflict resolution, play an active role in the global arena and play a role in international organizations (Ministry of Foreign Affairs Turkey, 2015). Based on the above, of course, it is very clear that Turkey's reason for normalizing relations with Israel is as a way to unite the two states of Israel and Palestine, as well as several other aspects that require Turkey to build cooperation, not hostility among themselves. This is a strategic step for Turkey to advance its interests, and this can only be done if Turkish and Israeli relations are established. This is evidenced by several incidents in the past that Turkey and Israel experienced rifts or dissolution of relations due to the Palestinian issue, such as the Israeli attack on Gaza in 2009 (The Guardian, 2016), the Mavi Marmara ship tragedy and also the Israeli attack on Gaza due to the transfer of the ambassador. to Jerusalem in 2018 (DuniaTempo, 2019). The history of Turkish-Israeli diplomatic relations certainly produces positive things for Palestine, such as Turkey's agenda in developing industrial projects in the West Palestinian region to boost the economy. With

this industrial activity, it is hoped that Palestine can take advantage of it for economic turnover and as an open work area for the community. In addition, Israel also allows Turkey to carry out humanitarian activities with Palestinians in the Gaza Strip, such as building hospitals, power plants and clean water supply stations (Aljazeera, 2016). Not only that, Turkey was allowed to send all aid to Palestine through Israel, and agreed to maintain Hamas diplomatic representation in Turkey on the condition that there is no terrorist activity in Israel (Hasan, 2016).

Some of the agenda above is Turkey's reasons in a political aspect that can be done by normalizing its relations with Israel. Turkey can easily carry out dialogue in overcoming conflicts between the two countries, so that the potential for deaths from war can decrease. By following the explanation above regarding normalization efforts in 2021, Turkey also continues to include its interests regarding Palestinian peace and asks Israel to cooperate on this matter. Indirectly, the normalization of Turkey and Israel itself has the goal of becoming a regional Middle East power. A critical attitude towards Israel regarding Palestinian peace

aims to gain legitimacy and achieve priority status among Islamic countries, to become a role model for Islamic countries (Jerusalem Institute for strategy and security, 2020). So that the level of analysis of the international system is what drives Turkey's activities to normalize diplomatic relations with Israel in the political aspect. The international system says that the interaction between countries which are the main actors in the international environment is the main focus of this level of analysis. The international system is the stage for every country in applying its foreign policy, Hudson argues that this position is a place for activities in responding to issues that exist in the international sphere. This phenomenon is seen in the relations between Turkey and Palestine as well as Turkey with other Arab countries even though Turkey is normalizing with Israel. Because foreign policy is a way to achieve national interests, various ways will be carried out to achieve them (Valerie, 2007).

Economic Factors Encouraging Normalization of Turkey-Israel

Turkey and Israel are two countries that need each other, in terms of politics, economy and security which is the reason for the two of them to cooperate. Israel has

natural gas resources that must be distributed, while Turkey needs gas wealth owned by Israel, the common goals and *national interests* of each country can be realized through diplomatic cooperation. During the Turkish minister's visit to Israel after the severance of relations in 2018, the two discussed further expanding economic cooperation, increasing the comparative advantage of each country both regionally and globally, especially in the face of a pandemic (CNBC News, 2022). The two countries agreed to improve relations on energy cooperation as a focus of potential areas of cooperation. Israel is a developed country in the Middle East and Southwest Asia in terms of economic and industrial development and has even become a competitive country in the world, ranking 19th in 2019 (IMD World, 2020). Israel's total GDP in 2019 was 394.65 billion US dollars, which is far compared to several countries in the Middle East, Egypt's GDP was 303.09 billion US dollars, and Jordan's was 44.53 billion US dollars (Kompas News, 2021).

The emergence of offshore gas reserves discoveries in the Eastern Mediterranean involving Cyprus, Greece, Italy, Israel, Egypt, Palestine and Jordan is having a major impact on the regional energy

security agenda. The gas reserves that have been discovered will be very favorable regarding gas export prospects. Turkey is a country that needs hydrocarbon, gas and energy reserves from surrounding countries that have abundant natural resources. In line with Turkey's growing domestic needs, requiring Turkey to pursue cooperation on this matter, efforts driven by energy security have become part of foreign policy in recent decades, the need for natural gas which is Turkey's main geopolitical and geo-economic goal can be seen in the table below, regarding the demand for natural gas imports (Statista, 2022)

| Year of | Demand (in bcm) |
|---------|-----------------|
| 2016 | 44.5 |
| 2017 | 51.6 |
| 2018 | 47.2 |
| 2019 | 43.4 |
| 2020 | 46.2 |

Table 1 Statistics of Turkish Natural Gas Import Demand

(<https://www.statista.com/statistics/703684/natural-gas-consumption-turkey/>)

Turkey's motivation regarding the natural gas policy can be described through the following 3 frameworks:

1. Become a country that depends on imports and secures its access to natural gas supplies to meet domestic needs
2. Aims to diversify existing supply and offset Russia's dominant role in the energy portfolio.
3. Turkey wants to strengthen its linkages regarding regional energy security and advance its role as an energy transit country, and a potential major hub for supplies to Europe.

From a geographical perspective, Turkey has the opportunity to gain one of the advantages of regional energy security balance. Firstly, the Black Sea is Turkey's main energy axis where the TurkStream and Blue Stream pipelines have been inaugurated to transport gas from Russia. Second, the Caspian Sea, which is also the main source of gas and oil supplies, is connected to Azerbaijan through the Southern Gas Corridor, as well as the Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan oil pipeline. With the discovery of gas sources in the last few decades, Turkey's foreign policy interest and orientation toward regions that benefit it and Turkey will rise to become a gas transit center which has been one of Turkey's goals for a long time. Cyprus, Israel and Greece are

developing as an "energy triangle" in the Eastern Mediterranean, Turkey which has conflicts with several countries in the region is a challenge in itself to take part in the benefits of gas energy. To realize its potential as a regional gas center, Turkey has entered into a partnership with Israel in realizing the gas pipeline agreement. Turkey left Greece and Cyprus over the planned pipeline project, due to some debate over maritime boundary issues. Israel as a cooperation partner can build a pipeline through Turkey without involving the territory that Greece and Cyprus are fighting over, this will be detrimental to the two countries (Forbes, 2022). Israel supports cooperation to realize the EastMed gas pipeline project, which brings Israeli gas to Europe as a major consumer (Trends Research, 2020). This is Turkey's strategy in forcing countries that are against it to cooperate rather than conflict, the left-over country will be greatly disadvantaged by the strategy being implemented by Turkey, seeing that as many as 122 trillion cubic feet of gas and 1.7 billion barrels of oil are located in the East Mediterranean basin which is equivalent to 76 years of gas consumption in the European Union (Forbes, 2020).

Before cooperating with Israel regarding the supply of natural gas, Turkey met these needs from Russia, but due to disagreements and being frozen, Israel has the potential to meet these gas needs in place of Russia. Turkey and Israel agreed to resume energy cooperation which had been abandoned since the termination of relations following the Mavi Marmara incident. Turkey wants to release the need for its natural gas supply from Russia and will compensate Russia regarding natural gas. Because of the economic value of Turkey and Israel, their bilateral relations have improved. Turkey is also cooperating with Israel in terms of tourism, to bring in tourists from Israel which contribute to Turkey's economic growth, the Israeli Foreign Minister said that Istanbul is a popular location for Israeli tourists (Republika News 2022). As many as 250 tourists were recorded as traveling to Istanbul (Trading Economics, 2022), through this normalization Turkey has the opportunity to increase its country's economic income. Because tourism is one of the most important economic sectors for Turkey.

Based on the previous explanation regarding the advantages of normalizing with Israel, the economy is a pressing

factor for Turkey to bring in investors and fight inflation (Times, 2022). Turkey's inflation in 2021 increased by 78.62%, when President Recep Tayyip Erdogan cut interest rates to boost the economy, which is expected to continue to increase until 2022 ends (BBC News, 2022). As a result, the value of the Turkish currency has plummeted and the country has to bear high costs when importing goods from abroad. Inflation this time was the highest compared to the past few years. The following is a table of Turkey's inflation from the past 5 years (World Data, 2022).

| Year | Percentage |
|------|------------|
| 2021 | 19.60% |
| 2020 | 12.28% |
| 2019 | 15.28% |
| 2018 | 16.33% |
| 2017 | 11.14% |

Table 2 Percentage of Turkey's Inflation in the Last 5 Years
(<https://www.worlddata.info/asia/turkey/inflation-rates.php#:~:text=For%202021%2C%20an%20inflation%20rate,at%20the%20beginning%20of%202022>)

National attributes of natural resources and economic capabilities are opportunities that Turkey sees in realizing its interests national

level, namely the development of the country's economy. With normalization, cooperation in various fields such as energy, infrastructure, and tourism will increase in the future. In the end, national interest is the main motive in cooperative relations (Rafqy, 2017). According to Valerie M. Hudson, the level of national attribute analysis in the aspect of natural resources and economic capability is a driving factor for Turkey's reasons for normalizing relations with Israel, especially in the economic aspect. Countries that are deficient in terms of natural resources will be active in their foreign policy to meet these needs, the natural resources in question are oil, mines, uranium etc. Likewise with the economic capabilities provided by Israel with normalization, according to Valerie M. Hudson opinion that the country's economic strength will influence a country's foreign policy (Valerie, 2007).

Military and Security Factors Encouraging Normalization of Turkey-Israel

Israel is a country that is qualified in terms of military strength and the arms industry in the world, since 1985 Israel has become the country that produces the best modern defense equipment

in the world (CNN News, 2021). So Israel is a strategic partner for Turkey in guaranteeing its military and security needs. Turkey's security has increased with the establishment of relations with Israel, supplies of weapons and aircraft have been fulfilled, as well as Turkey's security early warning system has been renewed. Intelligence cooperation is very important for Turkey because there is a threat of impact from the Syrian conflict. Israel is a weapons producer that has the potential to meet Turkey's security needs, as well as Israel has consumers in terms of its security and makes this cooperation mutually beneficial. Not only as a consumer of weapons, Israel can also help Turkey's interests, to stem the power of Arab countries which have great powers. Turkey also needs a western alliance in the Middle East region from the threat of Russia which shackles the region, Turkey sees Israel as a balanced partner in stemming Russia's influence in the Middle East, especially in the Syrian conflict which also has a bad impact on Turkey. Turkey and Israel also signed a *Defense Industry Cooperation Agreement* (DICA) military agreement regarding cooperation in sharing military technology and military training ground, this cooperation benefits

both parties, Turkey gets access to technology and weapons from Israel while Israel gets access to the largest airbase in Europe, as military training ground (Ilyas, 2018). Turkey stated that it has a vision in the aspect of the defense industry in 2023 to provide 75% of its military weapons needs, and this can only be done and assisted with weapons support from Israel as Turkey's security and military partner (Jerusalem Institute for strategy and security, 2020).

Both parties have the same perspective on security issues as a result of terrorist attacks, so military strength must be united in facing this threat. In the end, Turkey and Israel were shackled by a relationship of interdependence in security and military aspects, then complemented each other in responding to this phenomenon. Apart from that, looking at the history of Turkish-Israeli cooperation, this was strengthened due to security or military factors, from the MTCA cooperation that has existed since 1996, which includes military training, exchange of intelligence information and arms sales (Harhara, 2018). Turkey and Israel are aware of their needs regarding regional issues from Syria and the Eastern Mediterranean as

well as issues related to the Arab Gulf, this normalization is carried out to maintain their security from external threats. Turkey and Israel prevent other countries from allying with Greece and Cyprus due to disputes over natural gas, in this phenomenon Turkey cooperates with Egypt and the United Arab Emirates in responding to this phenomenon (AP News, 2021). So at the level of analysis of national attributes of military capability according to Valerie M. Hudson, military strength is a factor in determining foreign policy which includes ownership of weapons, technology and the military. Turkey sees that the national attribute of Israel's military capability is suitable for fulfilling Turkey's national interests in security and military aspects (Valerie, 2007).

Based on the discussion above, it can be seen that Turkey's reason for normalizing with Israel is to realize its national interests which are divided into three aspects, namely the priority economy, politics, and military or security. Even though the nature of Turkey's policy seems ambivalent, this is not without reason, Turkey is carrying out its strategy. Turkey's policy regarding normalization with Israel is a step in its foreign actions to achieve its

national interests in the international environment. Foreign policy is also an important component to mingle, and collaborate in an international context through diplomacy, both bilateral and multilateral cooperation. In carrying out foreign policy, it is necessary to consider several things to be able to achieve its interests, each country is free to determine the goals and direction of its foreign policy in accordance with the interests to be achieved. The theory of Foreign Policy Analysis by Valerie M. Hudson at the level of analysis of national attributes and the international system is relevant to the normalization of diplomatic relations between Turkey and Israel.

CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion above, there are several important things, among others, Turkey, which has maintained relations with Israel for almost 70 years, has experienced several times of termination of relations. Cooperation relations between Turkey and Israel have experienced ups and downs, and even experienced a break in relations for 6 years despite returning to normalize their relations in 2016. This happened again in 2018 due to the relocation of the Israeli embassy to Jerusalem. In 2021 start to show

closeness and plan to return to normalization, this collaboration is not without reason if you don't have an interest in it. Turkey and Israel have close ties regarding security aspects which extend to other aspects such as economics and politics. Although the relationship between the two has experienced ups and downs due to Turkey's commitment to Palestine which is included in the main agenda of its foreign policy, the cooperation between them continues. Regardless of the reason for the termination of relations between the two, Turkey recognizes that Israel is its strategic partner and has interdependence.

Turkey's policy regarding normalization with Israel is a means of realizing its national interests, especially in three aspects, (1) politics; Turkey has access to realizing Israeli-Palestinian peace, and will become a regional power in the Middle East regarding its contribution to peace. (2) Economy; Turkey can meet Israel's gas needs, as well as increase the number of tourists to Turkey, and reduce inflation that is currently happening in Turkey. (3) Military or security; Turkey's weapons needs are met by Israel, and various military cooperation that benefits both sides are established, besides that Turkey

has an alliance in stemming Russia's power in the Middle East region, as well as in dealing with the Syrian phenomenon. However, among these three aspects, the most pressing aspect for normalizing relations is the economic factor, where Turkey experienced large inflation in 2021 of 78.62%. The normalization action taken by Turkey is a strategy for launching and achieving its national interests.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Book

- Barston R.P. (2014) "Modern Diplomacy" New York: Routledge, 2014
- Judita H (2015) "Turkish-Israeli Relations. The Deterioration of Alliance Between 2003 and 2013: implication on the politics of the Middle East" Praha: Charles University Press, 2015
- Lentner. H (1974) "Foreign Policy Analysis: a Comparative and Conceptual Approach." Ohio:Bill and Howell
- Nasution (2003) "Metode Penelitian Naturalistik Kualitatif" Bandung: Tarsito
- Smith J.R (2000) "The Pragmatic Entente: Turkey"s Growing Relations with Israel" New

Jersey: Precinton University, 2000

- Valerie M.Hudson (2007) "Foreign Policy Analysis: Classic and Contemporary Theory." Maryland: Roman and Littlefield Publisher.

Journal

- Askerov, A. (2017). *Turkey's "Zero Problems with the Neighbors" Policy: Was It Realistic? Contemporary Review of the Middle East*, 4(2), 149–167. doi:10.1177/2347798917694746
- Ananda.D.N (2020) "Normalisasi Hubungan Timur Tengah Israel dalam Perspektif Neorealisme" Jurnal Academia 2020
- Guzel N (2017) "Natural Gas Factor in Israel-Turkey Russia Energy Triangle", Turkish Journal of Middle Eastern Studies, Vol: 4, No: 1, (2017)
- Hasan K(2016) "Towards a New Strategic Alliance between Turkey and Israel?" Al Sharq Forum Strategis Research,2016
- Jay A.S (2016) "Turkey-Israel Relations" American of the centre for the study of law & Public Policy 2016
- Kasdi. A (2018) "Fundamentalisme dan Radikalisme dalam Pusaran Krisis Politik di timur Tengah"

- Jurnal Penelitian, Vol. 12, No. 2, Agustus 2018
- Michel C (2014) "The US, Turkey, Israel: Triple Alliance" Montreal: Global Research, 2014
- Maharadi D.P (2021) "Persepsi Pemuda Islam Terhadap Kebijakan Erdogan At Konflik Palestina-Israel" Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Ilmu Komunikasi, Volume 5, nomor 2, November 2021, hlm. 107-117 <https://journal.unpak.ac.id/index.php/apik> e-ISSN: 2656-8306
- Nugrahani H.S.D, Nurmeiga.F (2016) "De-eroplanisasi Turki Pasca Kudeta Militer 15 Juli 2016" *Jurnal Ilmiah Hubungan Internasional*, 16(2), 143–158. <https://doi.org/10.26593/jihi.v16i2.3422.143-158>
- Nor M.R.D, Ibrahim.A.I (2019) "Pasang Surut Hubungan Turki-Israel: Kajian terhadap Hubungan Dua Hala at Era Erdoğan" *International Journal of Islamic and Civilizational Studies*. vol. 6, no.1 (2019) pp. 01 – 14
- Rimapradesi.Y & Sahide.A (2021) "Kepentingan Negara-Negara Arab (Uni Emirat Arab, Bahrain, Sudan dan Maroko) Melakukan Normalisasi Hubungan dengan Israel" *Jurnal Mandala* Vol.4 No.1
- Sari D.L (2018) "Operation Protective Edge 2014: Justifikasi Israel Terhadap Pelanggaran Hukum Internasional dalam Prinsip Just War" *Global: Jurnal Politik Internasional* Vol. 20 No. 1. Hlm. 70-93. DOI: 10.7454/global.v20i1.314
- Tahmi R.A, Rosyidin.M & Alfian.M.F (2022) "Analisis Kepentingan Nasional Uni Emirate Arab dalam Normalisasi Hubungan dengan Israel" *Jurnal of International Relations UNDIP* Volume 8, Nomor 3 2022

Thesis

- Dharmawan.Y.J.D (2018) "Tanggungjawab Negara Israel Terhadap Penyerangan Kapal Mavi Marmara Ke Kapal Bantuan Kemanusiaan Untuk Negara Palestina Tahun 2010" Skripsi Fakultas Hukum Universitas Jendral Soedirman.
- Farid.A.J.Q (2018) "Normalisasi Hubungan Diplomatik Turki-Israel" Skripsi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik Universitas Airlangga.
- Harhara.S.H (2018) "Analisa Kebijakan Israel Terkait

- Normalisasi Hubungan Diplomatik dengan Turki (2016) Skripsi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik Universitas Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah.
- Ilyas A.I (2018) “Ambivalensi Kebijakan Politik Luar Negeri Turki di bawah Kepemimpinan Erdogan Terhadap Israel” Skripsi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik Universitas Hasanuddin.
- Muhammad N.F (2018) “Analisa Kebijakan Turki dalam Normalisasi Hubungan Diplomatik dengan Israel Tahun 2016” Skripsi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang
- Nurhalizah M.E (2019) “ Kebijakan Luar Negeri Turki Terhadap Israel At Kepemimpinan Presiden Recep Tayyip Erdogan Tahun 2014-2018) Skripsi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dna Ilmu Politik Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya
- Rafqy A.A.P (2017) “Strategi Ekonomi Politik Turki (Studi analisis: Normalisasi Hubungan Diplomatik Turki-Israel (di tahun 2016)” Skripsi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Politik Universitas Sumatera Utara
- Syahrul.A (2017) “Normalisasi Hubungan Turki dengan Israel Paska Tragedi Mavi Marmara 2016” Skripsi Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Poltik Universitas Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah.
- Website**
- Aljazeera (2016) “Gaza’s Palestinians Divided over Israel-Turkey Deal” access from <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2016/6/29/gazas-palestinians-divided-over-israel-turkey-deal> [at 20 Februari 2022]
- AP News (2021) “Turkey Aims to Improve Ties With Egypt, UAE” access from <https://apnews.com/article/middle-east-africa-egypt-libya-europe-00c073dae7686f1561acb90385c2a37d> [at 10 Juli 2022]
- Anadolu Agency (2022) “Presiden Turki tekankan kerja sama energi dengan presiden Israel via telepon” access from <https://www.aa.com.tr/id/turki/presiden-turki-tekan-kerja-sama-energi-dengan-presiden-israel-via-telepon/2553271> [at 10 Juli 2022]
- CNN News (2021) “Alasan Militer Israel Canggih: 'Duit' AS dan Dikepung Musuh” access from <https://www.cnnindonesia.com>

- com/internasional/20210518164651-120-643912/alasan-militer-israel-canggih-duit-as-dan-dikepung-musuh [at 15 Maret 2022]
- CNBC News (2022) “Tingkatkan Kerja Sama Ekonomi, Israel & Turki Kian Mesra” access from <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20220525191300-4-341965/tingkatkan-kerja-sama-ekonomi-israel-turki-kian-mesra> [at 20 Juni 2022]
- CNBC News (2022) “Situasi sedang Panas, Pejabat Turki Bakal Datang ke Israel” access from <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20220421063952-4-333404/situasi-sedang-panas-pejabat-turki-bakal-datang-ke-israel> [at 10 Juli 2022]
- Dunia Tempo (2016) “Ini Alasan Presiden Turki Erdogan Bekerjasama dengan Israel” access from <https://dunia.tempo.co/read/788829/ini-alasan-presiden-turki-erdogan-bekerjasama-dengan-israel> [at 10 Februari 2022]
- Dunia Tempo (2019) “Genosida di Gaza Turki Tarik Duta Besar Israel” access from <https://dunia.tempo.co/read/1089002/genosida-di-gaza-turki-tarik-dubes-dari-israel-amerika/> full&view=ok [at 10 Februari 2022]
- Dunia Tempo (2022) “Era Baru Turki-Israel, Kunjungan Perdana Presiden Setelah 14 Tahun” access from <https://dunia.tempo.co/read/1569255/era-baru-turki-israel-kunjungan-perdana-presiden-setelah-14-tahun> [at 15 Maret 2022]
- Era Muslim News (2022) “Gedung Putih dan Yahudi AS Cemas Melihat Sikap Turki” access from <https://www.eramuslim.com/berita/dunia-islam/gedung-putih-dan-yahudi-as-cemas-melihat-sikap-turki.htm#.WUc3uYSLTcc> [at 10 Februari 2022]
- Forbes (2020) “Turkey-Libya Maritime Deal Upsets Mediterranean Energy Plan,” access from <https://www.forbes.com/sites/arielcohen/2020/01/08/turkey-libya-maritime-deal-upsets-mediterranean-energy-plan/> [at 15 Agustus 2022]
- Forbes (2020) “Will Natural Gas Isolate Turkey And Integrate Israel In The Eastern Mediterranean?” access from <https://www-forbes-com.translate.goog/sites/danielmarkind/2020/10/22/>

- will-natural-gas-isolate-turkey-and-integrate-israel-in-the-eastern-mediterranean/?_x_tr_sl=en&_x_tr_tl=id&_x_tr_hl=id&_x_tr_pto=op,sc [at 15 Agustus 2022]
- IEMed European Institut of the Mediteranian (2012) "Policy of The Zero Problems with the Neighbour" access from <https://www.iemed.org/publication/policy-of-zero-problems-with-the-neighbours/> [at 10 Juli 2022]
- Kompas.com (2016) "Israel dan Turki Sepakat Bangun Jalur Pipa Gas Bawah Laut" access from <https://internasional.kompas.com/read/2016/10/13/17301711/israel.dan.turki.sepakat.bangun.jalur.pipa.gas.bawah.laut?page=all> [at 25 february 2022]
- Kompas.com (2021) "Mengapa Israel Begitu Kaya Raya?" access from <https://money.kompas.com/read/2021/05/18/110201426/mengapa-israel-begitu-kaya-raya?page=all> [at 20 June 2022]
- Kompas.com (2022) "Turki Perbaiki Hubungan Diplomatik dengan Israel, Presiden Israel Langsung datang Pertengahan Maret" access from <https://www.kompas.tv/article/259646/turki-perbaiki-hubungan-diplomatik-dengan-israel-presiden-israel-langsung-datang-pertengahan-maret> [at 25 Februari 2022]
- Kompas.com (2022) "Babak Baru Hubungan Turki-Israel" access from <https://www.kompas.id/baca/internasional/2022/03/09/babak-baru-hubungan-turki-israel> [at 15 Maret]
- Republika.com (2022) "Erdogan dan Hubungan Turki dengan Israel yang Kembali Mesra" access from <https://www.republika.co.id/berita/r8xpuh320/erdogan-dan-hubungan-turki-dengan-israel-yang-kembali-mesra> [at 15 Maret 2022]
- Republika.com (2022) "Turki dan Israel Sepakat Normalisasi dan Revitalisasi Hubungan" access from <https://republika.co.id/amp/rcgl1up1998424191> [at 10 Juli 2022]
- Statista (2022) "Natural Gas Consumption in Turkey from 2005 to 2021" access from <https://www.statista.com/statistics/703684/natural-gas-consumption-turkey/> [At 15 Agustus 2022]
- Turkish Minute (2016) "Families outraged as Turkish court dismisses Mavi Marmara case against Israel" Access from

https://www.turkishminute.com/2016/12/10/families-outraged-turkish-court-dismisses-mavi-marmara-case-israel/?utm_content=buffer9d01c&utm_medium=social&utm_source=twitter.com&utm_campaign=buffer [at 10 Februari 2022]

The Guardian (2016) "Israel warns against travel to Turkey after Istanbul bombing." Access from <http://bit.ly/2qn1lFo> [at 20 Februari 2022]

Trading Economics (2022) "Turkey Tourist Arrival" access from https://tradingeconomics-com.translate.goog/turkey/tourist-arrivals?_x_tr_sl=en&_x_tr_tl=id&_x_tr_hl=id&_x_tr_pto=op,sc [At 15 Agustus 2022]

Trends Research (2020) "Turkey and the geopolitics of natural gas in the Eastern Mediterranean" access from https://trendsresearch-org.translate.goog/insight/turkey-and-the-geopolitics-of-natural-gas-in-the-eastern-mediterranean/?_x_tr_sl=en&_x_tr_tl=id&_x_tr_hl=id&_x_tr_pto=op,sc [At 15 Agustus 2022]

The Jerusalem Institute for Strategy and Security (2020) "Turkey as

a Major Challenge for Israel (and its Neighbors) in the 21st Century" access from <https://jiss.org.il/en/inbar-lerman-yanarocak-turkey-as-a-major-challenge-for-israel-and-its-neighbors/> [At 10 Juli 2022]

VOA (2022) "Presiden Israel Kunjungi Turki untuk Pulihkan Keretakan Hubungan" access from <https://www.voaindonesia.com/a/presiden-israel-kunjungi-turki-untuk-pulihkan-keretakan-hubungan/6476583.html> [at 15 Maret 2022]

VOA (2022) "Diplomat Tinggi Turki akan Kunjungi Israel untuk Perbaiki Hubungan" access from <https://www.voaindonesia.com/a/diplomat-tinggi-turki-akan-kunjungi-israel-untuk-perbaiki-hubungan/6538686.html> [At 10 Juli 2022]

Document

Annex II (2019) "Procedural Agreement on Compensation Between The Republic of Turkey and The State of Israel" diakses melalui https://www.icc-cpi.int/RelatedRecords/CR2019_00596.PDF [at 15 Februari 2022]

- IMD World Digital Competitiveness Ranking (2020) International Institute for Management Development access from <https://vitisconsulting.pt/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/IMD-World-Digital-Competitiveness-Ranking-2020-PT.pdf> [At 20 Juni 2022]
- Israel Weapon Sales (2019) “Weapons Sales in Israel decreased to 345 USD Million in 2020 from 363 USD Million” Access from <https://tradingeconomics.com/israel/weapons-sales> [at 10 Februari 2022]
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs Republic of Turkey (2015) “Policy of Zero Problems with our Neighbors” access from [At 10 Juli 2022]
- CNBC News (2022) “Ngeri! Inflasi Turki menggila 78,6% Tertinggi di dua dekade” access from <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20220704150053-4-352796/ngeri-inflasi-turki-menggila-786-tertinggi-di-dua-dekade/amp> (At 08 November 2022)
- BBC News (2022) “Inflasi di Turki Meroket 78% WNI Gulung Tikar dan Dikenakan Harga Lebih Tinggi Ketimbang Warga Lokal” access from <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/dunia-62036682>.amp (At 08 November 2022)
- Times (2022) “Turkey and Israel Are Normalizing Ties Again. It Will Be a Long, Uncertain Path” Access from https://time-com.translate.google/6206992/turkey-israel-normalization/?_x_tr_sl=en&_x_tr_tl=id&_x_tr_hl=id&_x_tr_pto=sc (At 08 November 2022)
- World data(2022) “Inflation Rates in Turkey”. Access from <https://www.worlddata.info/asia/turkey/inflation-rates.php#:~:text=For%202021%2C%20and%20inflation%20rate,at%20the%20beginning%20of%202022.> (At 08 November 2022)