Evaluation of teacher professional development program: A review of pre-service English teacher professionalism

Lailatul Nurjanah ^{1*}, Bayu Hendro Wicaksono ², Thathit Manon Andini ³, Muhammad Idris Effendi⁴

Universitas Negeri Malang; Indonesia^{1,4} Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang; Indonesia^{2,3}

Keywords:

English Language Pre-Service Teacher; Professional Competencies; Teacher Professional Development Program

ABSTRACT

The growing need for proficient educators has driven the government to establish extensive Pre-service Teacher Professional Development Programs. This research examined implementation of the English Language Pre-service Teacher Professional Development Program at Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang. Employing a field research approach, this qualitative study utilized the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, and Product) model to analyze the program's effectiveness. The study yielded descriptive data, shedding light on the program's impact on participants' professionalism. The findings revealed a significant enhancement in the participants' professional competencies. This improvement is evident in their expanded knowledge of pedagogical content, as well as their heightened skills in preparing all facets related to the English language teaching (ELT) process. This encompasses the creation of ELT materials, instructional media, the utilization of diverse teaching, and school administrative management. The significance of this research lies in its contribution to the ongoing discourse on teacher professional development in the context of English language education. The study's insights could inform educational policymakers, curriculum designers, and teacher training institutions about the strengths and areas of improvement within the program. This research aimed to enrich the quality of English language education and foster the growth of proficient and dedicated educators.

1. INTRODUCTION

The landscape of education is perpetually evolving, influenced by dynamic global developments, technological advancements, and shifting paradigms in pedagogy. Within this ever-changing educational milieu, the role of English teachers stands as a linchpin for the cultivation of linguistic and communicative competence among students (Hery, 2017). As the world becomes increasingly interconnected and English assumes a paramount position as a global lingua franca, the demands placed upon these educators are both diverse and substantial (Sharma, 2014).

Pre-service English teachers, while in the formative stages of their careers, are entrusted with the formidable responsibility of nurturing language proficiency, critical thinking skills, and cultural sensitivity in their students (Gürbüz, 2021; Hadi, 2019; Kazazoğlu & Ece, 2021). The effectiveness with which they execute this mandate has profound implications not only

Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning (JETLE) Vol 5, No 1, October 2023, Page 20-27 • ISSN 2686-665X

for individual student success but also for the broader socioeconomic fabric of nations. In light of these considerations, teacher professional development programs have emerged as a crucial mechanism for enhancing the professionalism and foundamental competence of pre-service English educators (Hadi, 2019; Hafsah M. Nur & Nurul Fatonah, 2023).

According to Ulum et al., (2023), one significant factor that influences teacher quality is their professional knowledge, specifically their content-related knowledge. Thus, the need of systematic, evidence-based evaluations of teacher professional development programs cannot be overstated. These programs, designed to equip pre-service teachers with the requisite knowledge, skills, and attitudes, must be rigorously examined to ascertain their efficacy in preparing educators for the multifaceted challenges of the modern classroom (Hills & Sessoms-Penny, 2021). Furthermore, the concept of professionalism in the context of teaching extends beyond mere pedagogical prowess; it encompasses the ability to create inclusive and culturally responsive learning environments, adapt to technological advancements, and engage in continuous professional growth and reflection (Samuels, 2018).

In the pursuit of evaluating the impact of teacher professional development programs on pre-service English teacher professionalism, it is imperative to consider the myriad factors that influence program outcomes. These factors include the program's curriculum and content, instructional methods employed, the qualifications and expertise of program facilitators, the duration and intensity of training, and the contextual factors within which these programs are implemented. The interplay of these variables adds complexity to the evaluation process, necessitating a comprehensive and multifaceted approach.

Furthermore, the global context of education in the 21st century introduces additional dimensions to the study. The COVID-19 pandemic has ushered in unprecedented challenges, highlighting the importance of adaptability and technological fluency in the teaching profession (Goldberg, 2021). At that time, the teaching and learning process was switched from face-to-face classroom instruction to online learning instruction (Yunita, 2023). Hence, when education increasingly embraces digital platforms and remote learning modalities, the evaluation of teacher professional development programs must also encompass their responsiveness to such transformative shifts (Xie et al., 2017).

The title of this article underscores the significance of investigating and assessing the effectiveness of such programs in shaping the professionalism of pre-service English teachers. This article delves into the critical aspects of teacher professional development and its impact on the burgeoning professionals who are entrusted with the task of imparting English language proficiency to students. This background of study underscores the critical need for a thorough examination of teacher professional development programs tailored to pre-service English educators. Through a nuanced analysis of existing literature, empirical research, and pedagogical paradigms, this study seeks to explore the multifaceted dimensions of pre-service English teacher professionalism, the role of professional development programs in shaping these dimensions, and the methodologies employed in evaluating program effectiveness. By delving into this intricate tapestry of factors, this research endeavors to contribute valuable insights to the field of teacher education, aiding educators, policymakers, and stakeholders in refining and enhancing these programs to meet the evolving demands of the modern education landscape.

2. METHOD

This research is a field study employing a qualitative approach that yields descriptive data. The research method used is the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, and Product) model to conduct a comprehensive evaluation of the English Language Professional Teacher Education Program for pre-service teachers (PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris) (Lee et al., 2019). The research population encompasses all instructors and participants in the first batch of the PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris, totaling 30 participants and 3 instructors, involving the Educational Personnel Education Institution (LPTK) responsible for the program. Primary data sources include teaching instructors, PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris participants batch 1 cohort of 2023, and LPTK staff, while secondary data sources encompass previous research findings, articles, and related scholarly works. Data collection methods employed comprise documentation, interviews, and observations. The observation results and data from other sources are then analyzed inductively, involving data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions. This approach aims to provide a deeper understanding of the implementation of the first batch of the PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris and its effectiveness in fostering the professionalism of prospective English teachers.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This research was carried out at an Educational Personnel Education Institution (LPTK) responsible for delivering the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris*. This institution is situated within the Faculty of Education at Muhammadiyah University in Malang. *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* was initially introduced as an initiative to fulfill the teacher induction program quotas established by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology (Kemendikbud). Additionally, the program aims to produce English language teachers who possess four fundamental competencies: pedagogical competence, professional competence, social competence, and personal competence (Hafsah M. Nur & Nurul Fatonah, 2023). The PPG program spans one year, encompassing both theoretical coursework and a Teaching Experience Practicum (*PPL*). Consequently, the implementation of this PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris is envisioned to nurture English language teachers with professionalism and outstanding competence in their field.

The results obtained from observations and interviews have unveiled several noteworthy discoveries regarding the curriculum development of the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris*. These findings underscore the necessity for enhancements concerning the practical competencies of prospective teachers in mastering the English language content they will be teaching in real classroom settings. It is in a line with Hadi (2017) that pre-service English teachers are entrusted with the formidable responsibility of nurturing language proficiency of their students. Therefore, observations and interviews indicate that there is room for strengthening the curriculum to endow future educators with a more profound grasp of English language content relevant to their classroom roles.

Moreover, other findings suggest that program planning should be more closely aligned with well-defined timelines to alleviate concerns among *PPG Prajabatan* students. Improving the consistency in providing clear and structured timelines will enhance the overall preparedness of *PPG Prajabatan* students. Nonetheless, it's crucial to note that concerning the comprehensive curriculum development with a focus on competencies, participant recruitment for *PPG*, faculty assignments for the *PPG* program, and competency assessments, these processes have been effectively and adequately executed.

Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning (JETLE) Vol 5, No 1, October 2023, Page 20-27 • ISSN 2686-665X

The courses within the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* are thoughtfully organized, comprising two primary types of courses: theoretical and practical. The theoretical courses are designed to provide a conceptual foundation and in-depth understanding to aspiring English language teachers. Some of the theoretical courses integrated into this program encompass Philosophy of Indonesian Education, Understanding Learners and Their Learning, New Technologies in Teaching and Learning, Design Thinking, Principles of Effective Teaching and Assessment in Secondary Schools, Social-Emotional Learning, Professional Teacher Education Seminar, Leadership Project, and Computational Thinking. These courses are structured with effective teaching principles and practices, with the primary objective of preparing future English language teachers to possess the four key competencies: pedagogical competence, social competence, emotional competence, and professional competence as (Hafsah M. Nur & Nurul Fatonah, 2023) stated. Upon successful completion of these diverse courses, graduates of the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* are anticipated to be well-prepared to embark on their professional careers with a high level of competency.

Based on documented data, participants in the first batch of the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* have achieved satisfactory results in various aspects, reflecting their progress and accomplishments in the program, as presented in Table 1 below.

Table 1. Evaluation Results of PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris Batch 1

	Table 1. Evaluation Results of PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris Batch 1 PP PPA PK GEV FU PGF PPA PK SP											
No	Name	FI	DP	I	I	SEL	El	PSE	II	II	PG	Final
1	Siti											PASSED
	Muthoharoh	A-	A-	A	A	A-	Α	A-	A	A-	A	
2	Akhmad											PASSED
	Akbar Wasis											
	Wicaksono	A-	A-	A	A	A-	A-	A	A	A	A	
3	Lailatul											PASSED
	Nurjanah	A-	A	A	A	A-	A	A	A	A	A	
4	Retno											PASSED
	Listianing											
	Pratiwi	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A	A	
5	Asih											PASSED
	Rahmayanti	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A	A	
6	Lintang											PASSED
	Sulistyorini	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A	A	A	A	
7	Fajar Jauhari											PASSED
	Shefryanto	A-	A	A	A	A-	A	A-	A	A-	A	
8	Sofia Imania	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	PASSED
9	Nur Auliya											PASSED
	Sajidah	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A	A	
10	Moehamat											PASSED
	Hendrik											
	Setiawan	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A	A	
11	Aditya											PASSED
	Bagus											
	Pradana	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	
12	M. Abiya'la											PASSED
	C.M	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	
13	Ratna Nur											PASSED
	Oktavina											
	Sari	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A	A	
14	Oktaviana											PASSED
	Titan Isnani	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	

No	Name	FI	PP DP	PPA I	PK I	SEL	El	PSE	PPA II	PK II	SP PG	Final
15	Marrisa											PASSED
	Rizqil											
	Haque	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A	A	A-	A	
16	Lucky											PASSED
	Meidianti											
	Darmawan	A-	A	A-	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	
17	Nabelda											PASSED
	Taufika											
	Misai	Α-	A-	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	
18	Putri Indah											PASSED
10	Sari	Α-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	D. CCED
19	Farial											PASSED
-20	Naftalin	A-	A	A	A	A-	Α	A-	A	Α-	A	PASSED
20	Imam											PASSED
21	Baihaqi	Α-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	PASSED
21	Findra											PASSED
	Dwisthasasi Al Aziz	A-	٨	٨	A	٨	٨	٨	٨	٨	٨	
22	Delia Hasta	Α-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A	A	A	A	PASSED
22	Wulandari	A-	۸	٨	۸	٨	٨	٨	٨	Λ	۸	PASSED
23	Sholahudin	Α-	А	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	PASSED
23	Yusuf	A-	۸	A	A	A-	A-	A	A	A-	A	TASSED
24	Diyah	Α-	А	A	А	Α-	Α-	А	A	Α-	A	PASSED
24	Apriyanti	A-	A	A-	A-	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	TASSED
25	Aulia	Λ-	П	Λ-	Π-	Λ-	Λ-	Α-	Λ	Π-	А	PASSED
23	Nurtina											TABBLE
	Rohmaningr											
	um	A-	A	A	A	A-	A	A-	A	A-	Α	
26	Friskilla											PASSED
	Galuh											
	Ratnasari	A-	A	A	Α	A-	A	A-	A	A-	A	
27	Sandita Nur											PASSED
	Indahsari	A-	A	A	A	A-	A	A-	A	A-	A	
28	Izza Amalia											PASSED
	Rahman	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	A	
29	Shofi Putri											PASSED
	Sa`Adah	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	Α	
30	Astutik											PASSED
	Dyah											
	Handayani	A-	A	A	A	A-	A-	A-	A	A-	Α	

The evaluation outcomes reveal that participants in *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* Batch 1 have achieved significant progress in various crucial domains. They have developed a profound grasp of Indonesian Education Philosophy, cultivated deep insights into learners and effective teaching methodologies, and honed their skills in integrating modern technology into English language instruction. This program successfully equip pre-service teachers with the requisite knowledge, skills, and attitudes to ascertain their efficacy in preparing educators for the multifaceted challenges of the modern classroom (Hills & Sessoms-Penny, 2021). This encompasses the creation of English Language Teaching (ELT) materials, instructional media, the utilization of diverse teaching techniques, and school administrative management.

Moreover, participants have gained valuable insights into vital aspects like Design Thinking, Principles of Effective Teaching, and Social-Emotional Learning. Their involvement in the Professional Teacher Education Seminar and Leadership Project as contributed to refining their leadership abilities and deepening their understanding of the teacher's role within a broader educational context. Additionally, their mastery of the Computational Thinking concept has become a valuable asset in addressing the evolving challenges of learning in today's digital era (Xie et al., 2017).

These satisfactory results provide an indication that the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* Batch 1 success in providing a robust foundation for aspiring English language teachers to develop into competent professionals ready to take on their responsibilities in educational institutions. Consequently, this data reflects the program's success in achieving its primary objectives, which include preparing high-quality English language teacher candidates with comprehensive competencies.

Regarding the practical courses, specifically the Teaching Experience Practicum (in Bahasa: *PPL*), participants in the English Language *PPG Prajabatan* program have also shown mostly positive evaluation outcomes, as evident in Table 2.

Table 2. Practice Course Evaluation Results of PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris Batch 1

Name	PPL I	PPL II	Final
Siti Muthoharoh	A-	A	PASSED
Akhmad Akbar Wasis Wicaksono	A	A	PASSED
Lailatul Nurjanah	A	A	PASSED
Retno Listianing Pratiwi	A	A	PASSED
Asih Rahmayanti	A	A	PASSED
Lintang Sulistyorini	A	A	PASSED
Fajar Jauhari Shefryanto	A	A	PASSED
Sofia Imania	A	A	PASSED
Nur Auliya Sajidah	A	A	PASSED
Moehamat Hendrik Setiawan	A-	A	PASSED
Aditya Bagus Pradana	A-	A	PASSED
Muhammad Abiya'la Charirul M.	A	A	PASSED
Ratna Nur Oktavina Sari	A	A	PASSED
Oktaviana Titan Isnani	A	A	PASSED
Marrisa Rizqil Haque	A-	A	PASSED
Lucky Meidianti Darmawan	A-	A	PASSED
Nabelda Taufika Misai	A-	A	PASSED
Putri Indah Sari	A-	A	PASSED
Farial Naftalin	A-	A	PASSED
Imam Baihaqi	A-	A	PASSED
Findra Dwisthasasi Al Aziz	A-	A	PASSED
Delia Hasta Wulandari	A-	A	PASSED
Sholahudin Yusuf	A	A	PASSED
Diyah Apriyanti	A-	A-	PASSED
Aulia Nurtina Rohmaningrum	A	A	PASSED
Friskilla Galuh Ratnasari	A	A	PASSED
Sandita Nur Indahsari	A	A	PASSED
Izza Amalia Rahman	A	A	PASSED
Shofi Putri Sa`Adah	A	A	PASSED
Astutik Dyah Handayani	A	A	PASSED
	Name Siti Muthoharoh Akhmad Akbar Wasis Wicaksono Lailatul Nurjanah Retno Listianing Pratiwi Asih Rahmayanti Lintang Sulistyorini Fajar Jauhari Shefryanto Sofia Imania Nur Auliya Sajidah Moehamat Hendrik Setiawan Aditya Bagus Pradana Muhammad Abiya'la Charirul M. Ratna Nur Oktavina Sari Oktaviana Titan Isnani Marrisa Rizqil Haque Lucky Meidianti Darmawan Nabelda Taufika Misai Putri Indah Sari Farial Naftalin Imam Baihaqi Findra Dwisthasasi Al Aziz Delia Hasta Wulandari Sholahudin Yusuf Diyah Apriyanti Aulia Nurtina Rohmaningrum Friskilla Galuh Ratnasari Sandita Nur Indahsari Izza Amalia Rahman Shofi Putri Sa`Adah	NamePPL ISiti MuthoharohA-Akhmad Akbar Wasis WicaksonoALailatul NurjanahARetno Listianing PratiwiAAsih RahmayantiALintang SulistyoriniAFajar Jauhari ShefryantoASofia ImaniaANur Auliya SajidahAMoehamat Hendrik SetiawanA-Aditya Bagus PradanaA-Muhammad Abiya'la Charirul M.ARatna Nur Oktavina SariAOktaviana Titan IsnaniAMarrisa Rizqil HaqueA-Lucky Meidianti DarmawanA-Nabelda Taufika MisaiA-Putri Indah SariA-Farial NaftalinA-Imam BaihaqiA-Findra Dwisthasasi Al AzizA-Delia Hasta WulandariA-Sholahudin YusufADiyah ApriyantiA-Aulia Nurtina RohmaningrumAFriskilla Galuh RatnasariASandita Nur IndahsariAIzza Amalia RahmanAShofi Putri Sa`AdahA	Siti Muthoharoh A-A Akhmad Akbar Wasis Wicaksono Lailatul Nurjanah A A Retno Listianing Pratiwi A A Asih Rahmayanti A A Lintang Sulistyorini A A Fajar Jauhari Shefryanto A A Sofia Imania A A Nur Auliya Sajidah A A Moehamat Hendrik Setiawan A-A Aditya Bagus Pradana A-A Muhammad Abiya'la Charirul M. A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A

Overall, the students of *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* Batch 1 have successfully applied their theoretical understanding in the context of teaching in the field, delivering effective lessons, and positively interacting with students. However, observational notes from mentor teachers reveal some challenges faced by certain students.

Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning (JETLE) Vol 5, No 1, October 2023, Page 20-27 • ISSN 2686-665X

Several mentor teachers (in Bahasa: *Guru pamong*) have expressed that some students still need to enhance their theoretical understanding of the English language content they will be teaching to students. There is confusion regarding certain English language theories and teaching materials that they must convey to students. This finding does not meet expectations under preservice English teachers must be capable and responsible in nurturing language proficiency of their students (Hadi, 2019). This indicates the need for further guidance and support in bridging the gap between theoretical understanding and effective teaching practices in the field.

Nevertheless, it is important to emphasize that the overall positive evaluation results reflect the progress achieved by participants in the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris* in developing their skills as teachers. These observational notes, despite highlighting certain challenges, also provide opportunities for improvement and further development within the *PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris*, enabling future teachers to become even more prepared and competent in teaching English to their students (Hery, 2017).

The findings provide valuable insights into specific aspects of the implementation of the English Language Post-Induction Professional Teacher Education *Program (PPG Prajabatan)* that require further attention. Improvements in curriculum development and program planning can enhance the effectiveness of this program in preparing more competent English language teacher candidates who are ready to tackle their roles in the education field. Therefore, these findings can serve as a foundation for improving the program in the future.

4. CONCLUSION

PPG Prajabatan Bahasa Inggris has provided a solid foundation for prospective English language teachers to develop their competencies. It has successfully produced teacher candidates with a profound understanding of educational concepts, classroom management skills, and mastery of relevant technology and teaching methods. However, further improvements are necessary, as the confusion in the theoretical understanding of the English language content to be taught to students highlights the need for more intensive guidance in integrating theory with teaching practice. Additionally, in response to the challenges identified in this evaluation, the Educational Training Institute (LPTK) responsible for conducting the PPG program should pay special attention to consistent scheduling. In this regard, better time management can help English Language PPG Prajabatan participants be better prepared overall, reduce potential stress, and allow them to focus on learning without disruption.

This study predominantly examines the overall effectiveness of teacher professional development programs for pre-service English teachers. However, it does not delve into specific aspects such as curriculum development, syllabus design, or discipline-specific activities within the context of these programs. As a result, it provides a generalized view without a detailed. In light of this limitation, it is recommended to conduct further research with a specific focus on curriculum development, syllabus design, and the incorporation of discipline-specific activities within teacher professional development programs. This study also has other certain limitations. First, data collection is primarily conducted from the perspective of instructors, with minimal input from program participants who are primarily involved in documentation processes. This one-sided approach could introduce bias and might not fully reflect the experiences and growth of pre-service English teachers, and the results may not comprehensively represent the true impact of the professional development program on the participants. To mitigate this limitation, future research should adopt a more balanced approach to data collection, including feedback from both instructors and participants. Second, the study lacks a clear connection between the evaluation

results and their practical implications for the participants' teaching practices in real classroom settings. To address this limitation, it is advisable to conduct a follow-up study that assesses how the program's outcomes translate into improved teaching practices, offering valuable insights into the program's real-world impact on teaching skills.

REFERENCES

- Goldberg, S. B. (2021). Education in a pandemic: The disparate impacts of COVID-19 on America's students. *Office for Civil Rights*, 1–61.
- Gürbüz, İ. (2021). Pre- service english language teachers 'critical thinking tendencies and their teaching-learning conceptions. 2(2), 22–34.
- Hadi, A. (2019). Exploring preparation of pre-service teachers' English proficiency and pedagogy: Stories from an EFL teacher education program. *Qualitative Report*, 24(8), 1946–1966. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2019.3771
- Hery, Y. (2017). Teachers and students perceptions of communicative competence in English as a foreign language in Indonesia. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 12(17), 867–883. https://doi.org/10.5897/err2017.3243
- Hills, D. C., & Sessoms-Penny, S. (2021). Pre-service professional development for inclusion teachers. *Research in Higher Education Journal*, 40, 1–17.
- Kazazoğlu, S., & Ece, E. (2021). Exploring Pre-Service and novice EFL teachers' intercultural sensitivity. *Novitas-ROYAL*, *15*(1), 76–89.
- Lee, S. Young, Shin, J. S., & Lee, S. H. (2019). How to execute Context, Input, Process, and Product evaluation model in medical health education. *Journal of Educational Evaluation for Health Professions*, 16, 1–8. https://doi.org/10.3352/JEEHP.2019.16.40
- Nur, H. M., & Fatonah, N. (2022). Paradigma kompetensi guru. *Jurnal PGSD UNIGA*, *1*(1), Article 1.
- Samuels, A. J. (2018). Exploring culturally responsive pedagogy: Teachers' perspectives on fostering equitable and inclusive classrooms. *Srate*, 27(1), 22–30.
- Sharma, S. (2014). Teaching English in a Globalized World. 1(1), 4652.
- Ulum, M. S., Rohmana, W. I. M., & Elvira, M. (2023). Dynamics of content knowledge: Learned from Indonesian Arabic teachers. *Education Research International*, 2023, e8883362. https://doi.org/10.1155/2023/8883362
- Xie, K., Kim, M. K., Cheng, S. L., & Luthy, N. C. (2017). Teacher professional development through digital content evaluation. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 65, 1067-1103.
- Yunita, R. (2023). The effects of online learning on English language education during the COVID-19 pandemic: A meta-analysis. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning (JETLE)*, 4(2), 84–97. https://doi.org/10.18860/jetle.v4i2.20617